

Exhibit 1

Selendy Gay Elsberg PLLC
1290 Avenue of the Americas
New York NY 10104
212.390.9000

34755



Andrew Dunlap
Partner
212 390 9069
adunlap@selendygay.com

March 31, 2023

Via E-mail

George LoBiondo
Patterson Belknap Webb & Tyler LLP
1133 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
globiondo@pbwt.com

Re: *Johnson & Johnson Health Care Systems Inc. v. Save On SP, LLC* (Case No. 2:22-cv-02632-JMV-CLW)

Dear George,

We write in response to your March 27, 2023 letter regarding the time period for SaveOnSP's document production.

You ask when SaveOnSP began operations. SaveOnSP's first health plan clients went "live" in September 2016. We understand that SaveOnSP provided notice to the first patient members of those plans starting after July 1, 2016.

In each of its Requests for Production, JJHCS defined the relevant time period as beginning on January 1, 2017. *See* Pl.'s First Set of Reqs. for Prod. at 5; Pl.'s Second Set of Reqs. for Prod. at 6; Pl.'s Third Set of Reqs. for Prod. at 6. You ask SaveOnSP to expand its document production to include responsive documents going back to when it began operations. SaveOnSP will adjust its production to include documents going back to July 1, 2016 if JJHCS will do the same.

We reserve all rights and are available to meet and confer.

Best,

/s/ Andrew R. Dunlap

Andrew R. Dunlap
Partner

Exhibit 2

Exhibit 3



August 1, 2024

Jacob I. Chefitz
(212) 336-2474

By Email

Meredith Nelson, Esq.
Selendy Gay PLLC
1290 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10104

**Re: *Johnson & Johnson Health Care Systems, Inc. v. Save On SP, LLC,*
2:22-cv-02632 (JKS) (CLW)**

Dear Meredith:

We write in response to your July 30, 2024 letter regarding SaveOnSP's relevant pre-April 2016 documents, which follows our previous conferral and several letters on this topic going back to June 21, 2024.

As you know, SaveOnSP previously represented that its personnel were unlikely to have generated relevant documents before April 2016, and that the earliest communications SaveOnSP had with its first client was in May 2016. This followed SaveOnSP's representation to the Court that it "began operations in 2017." It is now clear that all of those representations were false. Indeed, your letter notes that SaveOnSP custodians possess *thousands* of documents that hit on the parties' agreed-upon search terms before April 2016, which SaveOnSP has never even reviewed, much less produced. And although SaveOnSP previously represented that "the earliest communications SaveOnSP had with its first client was in May 2016," your letter confirms that SaveOnSP communicated with potential clients before that time.

Your letter concedes these failures but indicates that SaveOnSP is refusing to rectify them unless JJHCS agrees to undertake additional custodial discovery of its own. That demand is improper and unjustified because the misrepresentations at issue were all by SaveOnSP. We therefore reject your tit-for-tat demand.

Please confirm by August 5, 2024, that SaveOnSP will, without condition, produce the relevant 2015-16 documents it has identified and provide the information JJHCS has requested regarding its early client communications. Otherwise, we will understand the parties to be at impasse on this issue and will promptly seek relief from the Court.

We reserve all rights.

Meredith Nelson, Esq.
August 1, 2024
Page 2

Very truly yours,

/s/ Jacob I. Chefitz

Jacob I. Chefitz

Exhibit 4

Exhibit 5

Exhibit 6

Exhibit 7

Exhibit 8